SAUSNET Conference

27 January 2017

Chair: Nirmala Gopal

Matete Madiba:

- welcome

- reason for conference is crisis, and recent student efforts

- reflect on crisis and reimagine

- process started with dialogue at Wits

- support from trusted convenors

- SAUSNET network for transformation formed from staff at all universities

-- unions, staff associations, communities of practice, individuals

- 19 institutions represented

- other stakeholders

- SAUSNET call for action: call to university communities and the broader society; call towards transformative peace and justice; zero tolerance to racism; non-violence; democracy; equality; ecological justice

- acknowledge convenors: Vish, Matete, Clint, Khwezi, Yolanda, ...

- acknowledge trusted convenors: Mojanku Gumbi, Yvonne Mokgoro, Jay Naidoo, Louisa Zondo

- acknowledge chair of USAF: Ahmed Bawa

Khwezi Mabasa:

- goals and objectives

- trying to build civil society agency in higher education

-- crisis is a societal crisis and cannot be left to just university and govt

- debate the underlying systemic causes of the crisis

-- fees must fall was just a catalyst

- explore various policy alternatives towards more just higher education institutions

- contribute to national education crisis forum

-- convened by Dikgang Moseneke and trusted convenors

- deepen democratic debate between student formations and other stakeholders

-- students/staff are both fragmented

- institutionalise SAUSNET as a network of higher education institutions

- overview of the programme (as per final programme)


Nirmala Gopal:

- discuss 3 peace points with person next to you

- write up comments and paste on gallery


Chair: Yolanda Nongauza


Setting the context: Are universities in free fall? Has higher education policy advanced transformation?


Susan Booysen, Wits School of governance:

- crisis in universities mirror image of society, govt problems

- not directed replicated but connections

- fees must fall would not have been as much an issue if not for larger society issues

- economic crisis - pop growth 1.7% but economic growth 0%

- Statistician SA commented that Black students do not succeed more than White students or more than Black students did during Apartheid

-- Black students do not have the support structures, family, etc.

- many reminders from government that free education is only possible if recipients justify their free education by becoming taxpayers

-- this cycle does not work - low success rates, unemployment

-- common to other failed government policies, policies around NSFAS

- political culture accepts that protest is part of policy process

-- policies need to be extracted through protest

-- "smoke beckons" - draws in representatives from govt to engage with communities

-- voting is not enough - we must get benefits/delivery from representatives

-- this culture informs the FMF protests

- time is ripe for intense protests

-- ANC hegemony is in decline, cannot reply on older generations of support

-- policy/transformation/decolonisation gaps have been with us for 23 years

-- original euphoric dreams and hopes now disregarded, now "progressive realisation" and financial limitations

-- student protests in this context

-- elderly person from EC: "delivery is like the rain - it always rains somewhere else first but we know the rain will come here eventually"

- institutional failure is a society wide issue

-- what are the personal agendas of people in parliament, unfulfilled promises

- university management caught between state and students

-- ANC fighting back to secure a support base for the future

--- divide and rule, co-option, infiltration of student movement, allowing radicalism but capture students for ANC

- student anger based in incomplete transformation

- context of securitisation

-- universities and society are mirror images

-- in 2016: more security, intelligence gathering, monitoring of students, authoritarian society on campuses, increasing use of private security, more interdicts, hand of state security

-- what is the tipping point between protecting infrastructure and students wanting to be heard


Shafiq Mohammed Ameermia, Human Rights Commission (HRC)

- acknowledgement to trusted convenors for the example they set in the past

- report on Transformation in Public Universities in SA

-- started in 2014, report released in December 2016

-- invited all universities to tell HRC why transformation is not working

-- report on HRC website

- with so many inputs from students, economists, etc. there should have been solutions already, but this has not happened

- HRC promotes the protection, attainment, monitoring of HR, etc.

-- power to conduct investigations - so national hearings on transformation were convened

- findings of hearings

-- examine the extend to which transformation in terms of race, gender, language, etc. has occurred

-- noted context of other protests - and this will be included in a future report

-- 3 questions:

--- whether institutions have transformed in last 20 years

--- factors that have hindered transformation

--- steps recommended to be taken by govt and HE

-- issues noted in submissions:

--- transformation is complex and multilayered: attitudes, demographics, willingness to change, etc.

---- demographics appear to be changing but different in different institutions

---- some White universities still reflect majority of White students/staff

--- universities have a broader role to play than just economic role

---- curriculum must contribute to

--- increase in number of students and staff protests, lack of dispute resolution

---- need review of resolutions mechanisms, training of staff in resolution/mediation

--- exercise of democratic right to protest

---- universities and protesters both have rights and responsibilities

-- some findings on transformation:

--- our HEIs have not sufficiently transformed in 20 years, patterns of systemic exclusion and marginalisation persist

---- factors: lack of uniform understanding of trans., lack of will to trans., disparities in universities, lack of commitment to multilingualism and use of indigenous languages

- recommendations:

-- DHET must play meaningful role in transformation and hold HEIs accountable

-- DHET develop guidelines on transformation goals

-- HEI councils to report to DHET regularly

-- HEIs to include bodies such as students and unions in developing trans. plans

- in summary: transformation has been either technical compliance or bottom-up exercises by students and staff - hence very low success rates


Ahmed Bawa, CEO, USAf

- need a national commission on higher education: reimagining higher education for next 20 years and produce a social compact between civil society, govt, business, etc.

- 1995-6 commission on higher education commission

-- white paper on transformation of higher ed

-- gave rise to Higher Education Act

--- issues addressed by commission:

---- deeply fragmented higher ed system at the time, so produce a national system of higher ed

---- disarticulation of higher ed and needs of society

---- race and gender imbalance that pervade the system

---- need for HEIs to grapple with effectiveness, dropout rates

----- argued that dropout rate is similar to US dropout rate

--- 3 issues not addressed:

---- massification not really discussed

---- curriculum, languages

---- disparate funding of higher education in fragmented system

--- reasons for not addressing these issues:

---- delicate political times, trying not to destabilise system, do not want academics to leave

---- we were at the emergence of GEAR, no extra money for universities, GEAR introduced structural adjustment when higher ed investment should have happened

----- in fact, HE subsidy has increased at or above inflation, but subsidy per students has fallen, hence this crisis

--- outcome of commission:

---- lots of national bodies: DHET, CHE, CHE-Quality Committee, SAQA, National Advisory Council on Innovation, HE portfolio committee in parliament, FRD->NRF

---- all tap into national budget, do we need all of these?

---- institutional crisis is related to national crisis

- Higher Ed Act of 1997 gave us governance structure

-- institutional autonomy and accountability

-- cooperative governance - did we do this right?

-- strong state steering, to counterbalance autonomy

--- political and financial mechanisms

- looking beyond HE act and education department

-- neo-liberal management style shaped by national imagination, within broader framework

--- RDP led to GEAR, with lots of managerialism, ASGISA, GIPSA, African renaissance project, Operation Pakisa ... all influenced HE system

--- influenced by who the minister and govt is

--- merger was political and not educational, many disasters

- in 2009, Blade Nzimande has contributed to HE thinking

-- new DHET department

-- massive increase in financial aid

-- much higher level of state steering

- must applaud student activism but this did not begin in 2015, but 10 years before, crisis has been coming for 10-15 years but we did not focus on it

- we need to establish a civil-society-led post-school education commission for next 20 years


Discussion:

Khwezi Mabaso: state of Black universities is not addressed as much as White universities - what is the HRC doing?

Khwezi Mabaso: Black consciousness thinking on rejection of structures

Khwezi Mkhize: what is the role and power of councils? what happens if council does not act on commission recommendations?

Clint le Bruyns: to what extent are we as staff perpetuating political hegemony? staff hiding in their offices, becoming desktop scholars, seeing students as the enemy, or merely sympathy, only few journeying with students in critical solidarity

Question: Must not forget RU reference list gender violence protests. Interdicts as blunt instrument to clamp down on protests - what is the HRC stance on this? What is the human rights take on UCKAR/RU general interdict that has been overturned? Interim interdicts become permanent on some date - what about those cases?

Chumani Maxwele: Bonginkosi was arrested with no crime. This is a level of hypocrisy of academics, self-interested. No academics have put themselves on the line or write to request students being released. Worried about SA scholarship when scholars are not based on activism. No scholars have resigned from Wits because of security.

Pitika Ntuli: What do panelists believe as the meaning of transformation?

Brightness, NMMU: We are not discussing how the staff felt during FMF - staff against staff/management and not students. What about workplace bullying in HEIs?

Nirmala Gopal: How complex can transformation be when we have thousands of staff at HEIs? Has the HETN been interviewed in the HRC process? How binding are the HRC recommendations?

Mohammed Ameermia: Submissions were from 13 universities, including Black and White universities. HRC investigation was based on Reitz 4, SUN initiation death and NWU student death, since these were indicative of a national problem. Gender violence was included in the report. Re: interdicts, a research unit at HRC monitors this at a national level in relation to equality. Late entry to debate by HRC is due to lack of resources. HRC report requires a response from DHET within 12 months. After EFF judgement in 2015, HRC recommendations will be taken seriously. HRC will monitor implementation of its recommendations and not write new reports. On Bawa's comment that crisis has been looming, maybe it is not too late to address this with short, medium and long term measures, in terms of NDP and SDG goals.

Ahmed Bawa: power of councils stems from Higher Ed Act. Question needs to be raised in re-envisioning. Too many VCs operate in the view that they have little sway over council, rather than a same-side relationship. Need to strength our institutions like Senates and IFs. We cannot accept students in jail.

Susan Booysen: Many responses to need of students already in various ways. Book was compiled by academics who are deeply engaged, not sitting in ivory towers.

Comment: The interdicts need to be sorted - the HRC must deal with this systemically. UCKAR/RU is the only institution to not have an interdict because of opposition from staff.

Yvonne Mokgoro: was asked to addressed legal action taken against students in a later session.

Loshni Govender: Given recent HRC report, what is USAf's role in monitoring? What about deeply ingrained practices? What is the way forward in terms of accountability of institutions/managements, and interplay of different sectors of higher ed?

Faith, SUN: Dynamics of staff - how will we as staff reimagine our roles in the struggle? In response to "where are the students", students have been rallying on the ground and on Twitter over the vac period. Interrogate staff positions as older staff and academic staff about critical roles in the struggle.

Comment: In 1987 National Education Crisis Committee (NECC) presented at a conference of the national sociology association at UWC, chaired by Blade Nzimande. This crisis is repeating itself, with the same issues. Perhaps we should all sign a petititon asking for the release of Bonginkosi?

Wesley Seale: serious challenge with Black hegemony - if Black people are leading there will always be a challenge. We want the HRC to support those who are the poorest as those with resources go to court. Serious issues of racism at institutions - maybe HRC commissioners in provinces can tackle this?

Vishwas Satgar: report may be late but it is still useful. What is the reaction of universities and civil society? What is the strategy of the DHET in the university crisis - how to resolve the crisis?

Comment: Listening to panelists and students, it is clear we have different sets of information. Responses should not be by taking pot-shots. There is already a large and organised effort to release Bonginkosi. Reserve judgemental part of comments - there is a shared objective for opening up education. Remember that in the past students (at Turfloop) beat up soldiers in self-defence or reaction. Students are far more vicious in their comments within their own community but it is their own experience.

Jay Naidoo: We are here to build power, to balance forces. The current leaders are far from the national interests. Keep the focus of why we are here - building a new civil society movement commited to transformation, peace and justice. Learnt in trade unions that we will always be crucified. Disagree with people but defend right to disagree. Educational crisis is linked to societal crisis. We need divergent ideas. What will we take out of this meeting as a roadmap to win the future challenges and victories? No community (ANC, COSATU, PAC, ...) is homogenous. Challenge for leadership is to navigate through this to find common ground. Need radical discourse for how to deepen democracy and complete the revolution. Or next generation will judge the current one more harshly - transformation as an intergenerational project. Share divergent views and build consensus to people's power.

Pitika Ntuli: Will we always have problems when Black people lead?

Wesley Seale: The problems are perceived to be because it is Black people in charge - it is not just the ANC.

Lukhona Ngoni, UKZN: direct link between crisis and leadership. Problem is decline in leadership in HEI, not just poverty/unemployment/etc as stated in NDP. No leaders in HEIs. Staff are working harder. Management not consulted in these decisions that affect staff. Why must a university VC be an academic?

Vuyani Jacobs, UCKAR/RU NEHAWU: White management at universities does not like having Black VCs so they make life very difficult. Those managers have been there since Apartheid. Just changing the VC does not win the battle - policies are still there. Decision makers think of power and not Black people.

Clint le Bruyns: Setting the context should not just be analytical but should propel us into action. Now that we have heard about the context, what can be done?

If interdicts and basic contextual realities are not dealt with, we are not going to make progress. We need to identify where we come from when sharing experiences. He and another staff member were falsely arrested - orders came from university management. Colleagues teaching development and policy, social justice, etc. are not engaging with applying their disciplines in practice. Theologians will not even come to a prayer meeting. Ambiguity in perpetuating vs challenging the system - issues of context. Bonginkosi should not be in jail - some staff are active in engaging with this issue. Staff can shut down institutions. VC has not spoken once to students/staff even with the motto "every student matters".


Reimagining Higher Education in the 21st Century


Chair: Wesley Seale

- "Nobody thanks a fish for swimming"

- This conference should be illustrative of a paradigm change


Mashupye Herbert Maserumule:

- appreciates invitation to share "hallucinations"

- function of consciousness manifest in discontent

- basis: voices of education as a public good, along with student protests

- public good that, if supplied to everyone, nobody can be excluded from

- looking to the future

- book: "The future of a university" - "The future that we are talking about does not exist.  There is only a present.  But within this present there exists the idea that we have of a future.  But there also exists attitudes, patterns, etc.  The future is not to be discovered.  The future is to be created ... and invented ... implemented ... evaluated."

- context should be social justice

- many unasked questions

-- significant strides are being made, even if contestations over modalities such as finance

- whose knowledge are we teaching?  To what extent does it serve us and public interests?  Does it contribute to intellectual capital that the country needs?

- access must be accompanied by relevant, quality and utilitarian value of education

-- question: access to what?

- decoloniality gets contested reception


Chumani Maxwele:

- called on ancestors to evoke what is scholarship in Africa

- rural community view: university is a community to transmit knowledge

- no students are supervised on aspects of African culture

-- supervisors are gatekeepers of knowledge and students are chased away

- universities are about reproduction

- people want to assimilate with views of White people

- South Africans only reproduce White scholarship

- student activists are part of a long journey

- UCT changed its views on the RMF poo event within a week

-- thought deeply about the incident before embarking on this, prepared to lose everything, the event needed to upset White people

-- idea of transformation came from that day, people must be willing to lose privilege and title to make an impact on society

- a lot has been said but little has been done


Mathew Moyo:

- representative of CHELSA

- mission of CHELSA is to promote collaboration for goals of teaching+research

-- works with research offices, T&L centres

- technological changes in libraries of the future

-- libraries provide access to information resources, available 24/7

-- two libraries: physical and online

- freedom of expression

-- libraries regarded as safe space of study

-- freedom of expression and access to information are an essential concept for library professionals

- libraries are transforming spaces, intellectual commons for users to expand learning and facilitate the creation of knowledge

- flexible libraries are being organised around users

- libraries promote the works of researchers, and provide research tools

- building institutional repositories to exhibit research

- transforming institutional culture

-- libraries are integrated into teaching, embed learning attributes

-- bridge digital divide

-- multiple literacies, such as information literacy

-- lifelong learning, ethical practices


Discussion:

Comment: we have not systematically dealt with decolonisation. Many scholars were in Namibia and pursued the Africanisation project. We should recognise the effort of people in that project, such as Makgoba, Alexander, Mafeje, etc. Need to double efforts to complete journey.

Rozena Maart, UKZN: We have actually done a lot on African language but there are some complexities. Backdrop where students are told that European references are essential. Many academics are already teaching major African ideas. African books are available in bookstores in Canada, but not in South Africa, except when prescribed.

Maanda Mulaudzi, UCT: To Mashupye: Can you say more about the reimagined university fits into a global economy or how that global economy is reimagined/transformed?

Rochelle Jacobs, SUN: Changes in undergraduate curriculum ongoing and difficult. But traditional learning is valid as an academic project.

Lukhona Ngoni, UKZN: Millenials are in non-traditional knowledge spaces, more flexibility, more online. How do we cater for this? Academics teaching using old techniques must recognise that they are the problem, not the students. Multi/inter-discipinarity must be supported structurally, not at individual level. Specialisation of the 21st century must do courses across disciplines. Colleges are still in silos and promote linear career path. Person with BA runs an airline in the UK. Technology changing are not including all disciplines and results in buy-in problems and resistance.


Matthew Moyo: libraries will always continue to be there, though they may change in shape and size. GPS to locate books in library. Book delivery applications to get books to people.

Chumani Maxwele: UCT must be dominated by Africans, both academics and students. Then we decide what the content is. It is fine if we have White students, but the classes must be lectured in isiXhosa. Something wrong with Stellenbosch - local students feel misplaced but students from other countries fit in. Being deliberately provocative - things have been done before, but we are being provocative. Expected that BAC would have resigned, because they could get jobs at Fort Hare, but they did not because they share White privilege.

Mashupye Herbert Maserumule: technology can render people relevant. Professoriate is the fulcrum of the university, defining the culture of the university. Professors must be seen to be taking a leadership role but they are mostly rooted in Western epistemology. They will not leave behind their thinking and reincarnate in a new tradition. We need to take along the professoriate. There will be contestation but if this seeks to destabilise it will be problematic.


Comment, UFS: information resources are among the most expensive resources. Universities pay during research, then page fees and then buy back the journal. How will librarians make this information freely available?

Bellise, Wits: Sometimes academics forget that it is not about us - it needs to come from students. Students have the answers. Chumani: have you personally taught a course in isiXhosa? Underground library of Black authors at Wits. Academics must stop thinking for students start listening to students.

Nirmala Gopal, UKZN: Should not cause polarisation between students and staff. It has been a year of discussion about decolonisation but is there a strategy for implementation? Who are the stakeholders? Have we considered that higher education is as a consequence of basic education?

Vuyani Jacobs: who is the university community? When council includes people who are out of the community but the locals are excluded.

Ndumiso Dladla, UNISA: Anomaly that solution to problem was left to those who created and benefit from the problem. Moral responsibility was left to this. Unlike other countries, we did not have a nationalist movement and intellectual project was not re-centred like in Makerere, Ibadan, and Nairobi. Even apartheid government was obsessed with African projects but they produced information about Africans. Universities were not made for us - they were made to keep children of colonialists abreast of what was happened at home. We need to address political dimension.

Yvonne Mokgoro: Contestation between technology and human endeavour. What is the role of technology in knowledge production in the decolonisation project?

Question: What are the ethics of resistance?  And how do we transform institutional culture?  There are new forms of knowledge in transformative education, living theories, etc.  We can teach according to our own values and not the knowledge of others.

Jay Naidoo: Concept of education is very appealing.  50000 shop stewards trained in union.  Does education have to happen in universities?  Strategy: accepting digital mobile phones allowed leapfrogging that could empower people.  However it has been captured by large companies.  But the nature of work has been revolutionised.  Part of UN broadband commission for 10 years - redesigning the world.  What are we training people for when millions of graduates are driving Uber taxis?

Mashupye Herbert Maserumule: technology facilitates dissemination of knowledge but it does not replace the human being.  Unintended consequences of technology: students master the art of plagiarising instead of study.  It ought to be a space for co-existence between students and staff, a space for a clash of minds, where good research is conducted, where research is used for innovative purposes.  Destabilisation is necessary but it should not be for destructive purposes.  Navel-gazing discourse is not useful.

Matthew Moyo: cost of publication addressed by: national licensing, buying in consortia, disrupt publication industry and avoid expensive vendors.

Chumani Maxwele: we are not ready for what Mamdani proposed for an African studies department.  Departments elsewhere are much better resourced.  We need to re-centre the dialogue to talk about contentious issues in the university.  We need to honour elders of the rural community who know the history of the country.  Indunas who know the history of SA are not university academics.

Wesley: how does FMF affect quality?  We need to think of other issues.

Dialogue as a Pathway to Transformed Higher Education

Judge Yvonne Mokgoro, Trusted Convenors:

- representing the convenors initiative, put together by Dikgang Moseneke, to advocate and promote dialogue among higher ed roleplayers to resolve current crisis

- efforts will culminate in a convention on 25/26 February, to get input from a complete system of roleplayers, to find sustainable solutions

- convenors work with groups on the ground to explore solutions

- number of initiatives of dialogue within and among groups: students, parents, institutions

- found it critical for all critical roleplayers, including the state, to come together at national level; we all have the same objective to bring real transformation and sustainable solutions to our education system as a whole

- in defining transformation, some see decolonisation as central

- since 1990s negotiations we have been highly regarded internationally for the manner in which we achieved democracy through negotiation

-- blood was shed and we realised that there is a need to talk

-- outcome and impact may not have completely achieved what we intended

-- 20 years later we realise some of the weaknesses

- dialogue is central and without this we will not resolve the crisis

-- prerequisites for dialogue: it will not be easy and smooth sailing

-- 2017 academic year runs the risk of the same crisis unless we act and talk about how to avert a repeat of 2015/6

- we all desire to have a peaceful academic year

-- some levels of restlessness are emerging and we need to deal with issues; dialogue/trust/sincerity/openness/tolerance are central aspects

-- then we can debate our approaches; show respect by agreeing to disagree; be tolerant of views; be sincere in our goals

-- need to agree that we have a common goal - transformation in education; everyone fundamentally agrees

-- broad agreement on issues; need to show through action that we are on the same side; such agreement creates trust

- how is it that bastions of learning and knowledge have had high levels of violence

-- militarisation and student violence; role of the state

-- civil society interventions and students discounting civil society

- enabling environment needed on campuses; we all have a role to play

-- access to dialogue

-- cannot place blame on admin, staff, students

-- need to find one another, find the obstacles and address the obstacles

-- need hope; be constructive; avoid negativity; display empathy

- universities are mirrors of society

-- need to close deep divisions in our society/universities; impact of poverty - wealth gap; hope that education will alleviate disparities

--- education was the only way to get where we are today

--- need to use education to liberate us

- legal actions

-- we are all accountable for our actions in non-transformation of universities

-- nobody is calling for students not to be accountable for transgressions

-- many students were disciplined, arrested, jailed, denied bail

-- we cannot call on universities to withdraw charges against students - the state has charged students

-- some students could not write exams because of interdicts

--- some universities have assisted students write exams

-- might have to find a way to address cases where students may not continue their studies; while still requiring students to be accountable for their actions

-- convenors and SCC to negotiate with NPA to resolve issues at state level; while holding students accountable

--- impress on NPA to take restorative justice approach, taking into account context of student activism; find methods to alleviate jail, denial of bail, etc. for students to still pursue studies

--- view student activism as a social justice issue rather than as a criminal issue; students will have to undertake that their activism will not result in the same challenges in 2017

--- same process needed for students and administration on campus

- have to adopt the approach of a caring society as expressed in our constitution


Discussion:

Clint le Bruyns: deeply depressed with the narrative. Police did not arrive because students did something wrong - they are there beforehand. Illegal gatherings and students criminalised for even meeting for lunch. When Clint was arrested, a student was arrested while walking to class. Context of repression; not about justice or students acting violently.

Koogan Pillay: How will we ensure that all the key voices are at the convention?

Yvonne Mokgoro: saddening to hear of experiences at UKZN. We spoke of need to hold authorities accountable. There is still room for dialogue in such situations, maybe initiated by staff delegations. Formed Anti-Repression Forum when working as an academic, to engage the university through activism. What needs to be done will be dictated by circumstances, but there is always room for dialogue. Bonginkosi's case is supported by various NGOs and there is work being done as the case gets before the Supreme Court. There will be provincial events where everyone will be heard; convenors will ensure that all voices will be heard.

Jay Naidoo: idea of convenors as creating a safe space to deal with shared crisis. Reflects a system in terminal crisis, locally and internationally. Majority of people fed up with system not working for them. Fighting social justice issues in the world. Decolonisation is important also because it questions the capitalist and neo-liberal system. Resistance all over the world - people have had enough - and resistance met with violence. We have to compel the state to represent the interests of the people. Convenors creating space for people to put proposals forward to transform education.


Gender Violence and Transformation

Chair: Khwezi Mabasa


Catriona Macleod, UCKAR/RU:

- acknowledge students who put issue on the agenda through activism

- prevalence of gender violence is probably not highest at UCKAR/RU but there is activism there

- did not lead to coherent consistent policies

- process for sexual violence task team

-- set up differently from other task teams

-- may be applicable to other institutions as well

-- meeting of students, deans, management during protests

-- 3 staff + 3 students put together initial terms of reference

-- discussed at public meetings, and circulated to all staff for comment

-- broad invitation to all staff and students to volunteer for task team

--- assessed spread of people for gaps

- mandates:

-- ways in which experiences can be heard in a safe space

-- review policies and procedures

-- embedding issues of sexual violence in curricula

-- recommend ways in which systemic issues that promote rape culture may be addressed

-- engagement with local, national and international

-- implementation over time

- operation:

-- 6 task teams, one per mandate

-- draft reports sent to entire university community

-- advice from external legal experts and NPA

- SVTT key issues:

-- 3-pronged justice approach

--- retributive justice (people go to criminal justice system, DC)

--- remediation (where the complainant wants univ to know but does not want action themselves), mediation (only really for minor issues) and restorative justice (harms (not guilt) are acknowledged and amends made)

--- reparative justice (systemic processes that address gender norms underpinning rape culture)

---- individual/collective; material/symbolic

---- safe spaces, curriculum, extra-curricular activities, transformation of institutional culture, fostering gender equity

-- who takes responsibility?

-- one comprehensive sexual offences policy

-- summarised and easy to read

- important institutional autonomy of SVTT

- implementation within Equity and Institutional Culture office

- report at: Rhodes/CSSR/Policy Brief/Feedback reports


Rochelle Jacobs, SUN, Unashamed:

- SUN not taking sexual harrassment cases seriously

- organisation wanting to bring conversations around rape culture to university campuses

- shame and stigma and people do not talk so we do not know the extent

- weekly talks/workshops to get people to talk, held with staff, workers, etc.

- at workshops people get the typical questions

- negotiation requires acknowledgment that there is a problem

-- most staff are defensive

- not enough severity and weight given to these problems

-- in 2015 protesting students were given R3k bail, alleged rapists were released on R500/R1000 bail

-- task team report at SUN is not yet known; process is secretive

-- staff not taking this issue seriously

- people subject to sexual harrassment find it difficult to go to police - many have gone to Unashamed instead

- Calisto reporting system for reports to police on sexual harrassment or discrimination; reports can be submitted or matched against other reports


Discussion:

Marelie Johnson, SUN: with gender and violence, there is lots of support, but less support for race/class issues.

Faith, SUN: commend task team at UCKAR/RU for its high level of public participation. Does not admitting guilt not perpetuate a rape culture?  Our levels of violence are much higher than countries like the US.  SUN advocated not to have mediation.

Nirmala Gopal: was it always that women have presented on gender-based violence?  What about when women abuse other women psychologically?

Sibongiseni, CPUT: what are universities doing about other aspects of abuse?  What about females who get promoted because of sexual favours?  Students who rural areas who cannot articulate and suffer in silence - what about them?


Catriona Macleod: intersectionality is a reality - race/class/disability/etc.  Sexual violence takes places in an intersectional context.  One recommendation is that other forms of violence e.g., xenophobia, racism, may need a similar approach to SVTT.  Mediation was retained because lawyers suggested instances where mediation may be appropriate.  In restorative justice, guilt may have criminal implications so this is not the aim - the aim is to admit harm was caused.  Restoration could include apologies, payment for medical expenses, enrolling in gender courses, educating peers, etc.. SVTT process applies equally well to same-sex abuses.

Rochelle Jacobs: male privilege can be explained to women far more easily, and White privilege can be explained to women more easily.  Gender issues are easier to acknowledge than race issues.  We have to change the way people talk about sex and consent - current students cannot talk about sex easily.  Negotiation is still problematic but we need to talk about the issues.


Mateta Madiba: we are in this together - it is not a separation of staff and students.  Frustration of private security harrassing people while campus is quiet.

Funeka: prevention is better than cure.  What are the perpetrators' view on women and rape - this is an opportunity to work with schools, and males to engage with males on sexual violence issues.  Sad that we even need to have such task teams.

Comment: gender was not an organising principle in some African/Bantu societies. Some authors have questioned gender as an organising principle. Current notion of gender was introduced by colonial regime. Rationale for violence is not the one used by the analyst.

Rob, SUN: SUN administrative is complicit about violence against women, in creating environment such as single gender residences. Double standards in residence rules for visitors. Culture that prizes a highly problematic version of femininity, which also does not resonate with Black students.

Comment: uncomfortable with any notion of negotiation. Consent is also very problematic - this is only centred because of law, not common practice. We should not prepetuate the notion that women are only here to say yes or no. Problematic that White privilege can only be understood through gender inequality. Not interested in choosing between gender-based violence and racism. We need to be careful of images, such as the problematic image of Black men as rapists. No concept of the vulnerability of young African men in situations of violence.


Rochelle Jacobs: focus group to talk about consent. Race cannot be understood just by gender, but it might be an easier stepping stone to get people to engage. On prevention, the "illness" already exists so it is too late to just prevent rape culture. Hooters list (in bathroom) of "drinks" you can order that indicate to the barmen that you are feeling unsafe, need a ride home, etc.

Catriona Macleod: sexist residence traditions at RU/UCKAR as well. University trotted out platitudes but this has no effect. SVTT minutes were publicly available on Facebook, but Senate minutes are confidential - can we have transparency of minutes at universities? We still have the colonial legacy of the hypersexual Black male - how do we counter this while dealing with gender-based violence? African feminisms is not a single idea. Transnational feminism - understand particularities within the context of chains of equivalences.


28 January 2017

Chair: Michelle Williams

- merge of parallel sessions 1 and 2

- write down one policy idea and one idea on role of sausnet going forward to feed into drafting committee


Jay Naidoo:

- practical thoughts on taking process forward

- what does the leadership require in process of building a movement

-- power derived from constituency, legitimacy, mandates

-- understand relationship between unity and struggle

-- tame the eagle

-- listen to others

- lots of social forces and contradictions within that

-- keep consistent, never panic, guided by principles

- radical transformation is about organising people, not messiahs

-- constant site of integenerational struggle, place to build power

- victory is having clarity of vision, building unity and leadership, vision, building democratic practice

-- how do we cocreate vision and local leadership

- universities are a nursery for revolutionary ideas, but have been quiet

-- students are critical for challenging the status quo, nothing to lose

- revolutionary alliance between students and left intelligentsia

- education crisis linked to societal crisis, which is local and global

-- roots are in the economic system based on accumulation and greed at the expense of human and socio-economic rights

-- 8 people having more wealth than 3.5 billion

-- capitalism has smashed all other systems of knowledge, commodified education

--- grey suits have power over regions of the world and politicians

- what is the vision that will capture people's imagination

-- people are already organising but they get crushed by govt

-- what we are taking on is not just VCs or govts

- this is will not be built in one weekend only

-- we cannot do it alone - so build coalitions

-- how do we use moral political persuasion to bring people on broad

-- what is strategic core? - in 80s it was unions, youth, women, etc.

-- who are the alliance partners?  Consider govt's nuclear power project that will cost a lot but not yield the benefits we need.  What do we say as education sector when we are negotiating for funding?

-- coalition partner - just energy future

--- we know the cost of fossil fuels and other forms of energy is cheaper

--- cost of decommissioning nuclear power stations is the same as building one

--- we should be challenging this

-- coalition partner - people fighting for food, land, etc.

- build colatition with people wanting a different future

- convenors trust in stakeholders in crisis

-- situation inspired by students uprising in resetting democracy

-- completing the revolution - this is the job of our generation

--- Land issues, food sovereignty, economic liberation

- where govts are captured, and there is factionalism, we need civil society

-- policies must come from stakeholders, after building our organisations

-- first part: deal with higher education

- need active citizenry that does not outsource its power

- need roadmap to reimagine education in 21st century

- NECC must bring together everyone to finish this task

- going forward

-- institutionalise network, building constituencies

--- persuade the majority to join and believe in what we are fighting for

-- build policy agenda around systemic transformation, national agenda, global agenda

-- public debate on tradeoffs

-- need resolutions - hope the SAUSNET declaration is radical and militant

--- statements on students who are being arrested

- protect constitutional right to protest

- take a view on nuclear deal, right to food and land, economic transformation

- do it for the millions of people of out country who want the democracy to work


Lukhona, UKZN: how do we deal with constituencies that are mobile and constantly changing?  How can there be broad change - people may alienate others?

Maanda, UCT: how do we negotiate revolutionary alliance when there are different groups - such as students and staff?

Jay Naidoo: building a network of permanent elements of the universities.  SAUSNET as a network of unions and staff associations.  Those constituencies need to be actively built.  Talk to all staff and workers of the universities - the middle ground can shift.  Most lecturers and staff want permanent solutions and that unites us.  In 1960s revolution, we were defeated because the women, workers, parents were left behind, so the the struggle was isolated and smashed.  Strategic alliance had a core of youth, woman, unions, etc. and thousands of organisations that supported the core.  Nuclear coalition is similar where on this issue students, business, etc. had aligned views.  There is a distinction between strategic alliance and single issue alliances.  Regarding mandates, remember that students will leave university.  The mandate for SAUSNET is much more important, but alliances are then needed with other groups on a strategic basis, with food security, unions, etc.


Financial models for higher education


Sonqoba Maseko, DHET ministerial task team:

- set up after 2015 presidential task to look into higher ed funding

- ministerial task team set up in April 2016, not inter-ministerial task team

-- finding solutions to funding issues for very poor and missing middle students

-- looking at relevant legislation and policies

-- issues of graduates who are unemployed

-- efficient and robust model

-- Minister appointed a reference group of broad stakeholders to interrogate the fundings

- we all know NSFAS is broken

-- if there is a broad blank canvas, how can we fund higher ed

- workstreams:

-- project management

-- legal

-- funding

-- origination

-- social impact bond (SIB) - Bertha Institute and ...

-- ISFAP pilot - driven by SAICA

-- systems and technology - BASA

- consultation with Business Leadership South Afriac (BLSA) and Business Unity SA, BASA, ASISA

- Ministerial reference group:

-- student organisatons approached: SAUS, SASCO, PASMA, DASO, EFFSC, SAFETSA

-- HEIs: FinAid practitioners of SA, Univ Council Chairs (UCCF), USAf

-- govt: DHET, Treasury, Planning/Monitoring/Eval, DTI, NSFAS, SETAs, SARS, BBBEE, CHE

- Ikusasa Student Financial Aid Scheme (ISFAP) blueprint

-- based on constitution, section 29(1), "further education ... must be made progressively available and accessible"

-- significant number of very poor and missing middle TVET students already receive fee-free education

-- possible fee-free univ education in short term with grants/bursaries, ECPs and loans to poor and missing middle

-- full report is out for public comment

- key strategic objectives of the model

-- constitution does not promise higher education

-- efficient model

-- align with NDP-required skills

-- reduce dropout rates, NSFAS dropout rate is 60%

-- improve stakeholder involvement in the system, including in funding it

- operating structure

-- NSFAS was not designed for R1billion but it deals with R17-18billion

-- cannot get societal outcome if this is purely private

-- funding comes from all government bodies, foundations, etc. and channeled through NSFAS

--- current conversations within govt bodies on how funding works

-- NSFAS only gets the money and has arrangement with others for management

-- Manco/ISFAP non-profit company that enters into a triple-P arrangement with NSFAS

--- DHET specifies what ISFAP does

--- ownership could be partly private, partly public

-- FundCo is a channel for private sector funding: foundations, CSI, banks, DFIs, long term pension fund investments, capital investments

-- grants (as opposed to loan) according to level of income:

--- very poor get 3.5 years of grant (for a 3-year degree)

--- poor get 2.5 years of grant

--- lower missing middle get 1.5 years of grant

--- upper missing middle get 0.5 years of grant

-- remaining part is a loan

-- at 600k missing middle, 65% of students are covered

-- different cutoff points have been investigated, we need to decide what we mean by poor

-- sources of missing funding: expected family contributions, commercial loans, cheaper/easier ISFAP loans, bursaries, salaries

-- what will be funded: total cost of studying, academic/social/medical support, mentoring

-- funding

--- 65% of university students funded up to 600k will cost R42billion

--- short term: govt 17bn; BBBEE skills dev 8bn; private capital 0.5bn; DFIs/foundations/CSI 1bn; current funding gap 15.5bn; sum = 42bn

--- medium term = 45bn

--- long term: funding gap reduces to 3.2bn; sum = 48bn


Khaya Sithole, LESEDI education endowment fund:

- mob-driven process (cops throwing stones at students); students unhappy that DHET had not provided solutions

- 14 students created a war-room to find a solution, people with personal experiences with failure of current funding model

- we should not rely on the constitution as a guide at face value

-- basic education was free only because matric certificate was considered entry for job

-- undergraduate degree should not be considered basic education

- overwhelmingly majority poor society

-- asking students how much they can afford is offensive

-- if most students say they cannot afford, then shift is needed

- 27% unemployment rate, 50% in 18-35 age group

-- unemployable, some because of wrong skills

- 92% of graduates end up in employment, so ask people when they graduate, not when they arrive

- argument that we cannot afford education is intellectually lazy

- this is a matter of budgetary prioritisation

- higher education crisis has escalating costs, declining subsidies and inadequate funding solutions

-- university enrolments doubled over 15 years

-- costs went up by 72%, govt subsidy went up by 44%

-- costs outstripped inflation between 2009-2015, financial exclusion

-- system has not proportionately increased Black students

--- 10% Black->15% Black; 50% White->57% White

- balance in 3 streams of income has changed

-- in 2000 state used to pay 50% but in 2015 only pays 38%

-- individuals now have to fill the gap

- NSFAS designed in 1997 as interim but has not adapted

-- NSFAS ceiling of 67k, 61% of family income paid for NSFAS students

- government interventions in 2015/6/7 are inadequate

- how much do we need? and where do we get it from?

-- multipronged solution

-- 25bn (of 76bn total cost) is funding gap; state 29bn; corporate 22bn

-- principle of free for all, Black tax issues

-- are the rich being subsidised by the poor?

-- all graduates who benefit from subsidies should pay back

-- state should restore its 50% contribution: 12bn

-- create a capital infrastructure fund in addition to current strea of income: 10bn

-- education endowment fund - NSFAS, skills levy, corporate capital fund, education levy: ??

- phased funding of students in tier 1/2 (most desperate need), then tier 3/4, then 5

-- cost of funding 100000 students is 4bn - full cost is 8bn

- comparison between Lesedi and NSFAS

-- NSFAS ignores families above 122k; recovered through direct repayments; only charges poor beneficiaries of education

-- Lesedi has free education; starting at 300k income; gets the rich to pay through permanent contributions

Discussion:

Nomalanga: both models depend on functional growing unencumbered economy. How do we factor this in? How can a precarious state guarantee a 10-year bond?

Barry, Wits: how are Fundco and Manco accountable? How do we trust them? What happens in a recession? Where are the loans coming from and how are they structured in relation to banks?

Lukhona: what is the threat of piloting a new system while commission is ongoing? ISFAP model uses 65% for students while Statistician-general says it is 80%. What are students paying for? How many students pay fees? CHE is already looking into this.

Comment, UL: It is wrong to say a particular issue has been over-debated when we still have the problem. Models do not appreciate pressures of the neo-liberal global order, and only local political economy. Why do some universities charge 150k tuition fees when others charge 20k?

Maanda, UCT: the audience here is missing from the ISFAP reference group. What is the implication of paying staff in the Lesedi model? How do we expect an absent state to not only provide more money but also administer this?

Johnny, Chamber?: lessons learn from WEF responsible leadership. Sentiment of anti-globalisation and anti-establishment across the world. Are we not talking about anti-establishment in South Africa? Private sector says skills it gets are not what it needs - this is a waste of money. Is it time to get companies into the classroom?

Sonqoba: having conversations with private sector, such as BLSA, BUSA, HRBC. Corporates are stating what skills are currently missing. Support also includes career guidance so people study what will lead to employment, training in scarce skills, etc. Acknowledge staff consultation is missing - regional engagements to engage with university staff. Pilot is to test some elements, understand the pitfalls and what is needed at institutions - focus on missing middle. Pilot students will get funding to completion even if pilot is not successful. Far from a final solution - still need discussion with all. Commission has to come out with a report so decisions can be made and decisions can be implemented. There are different datasets - ISFAP projections are based on various parameters. Fundco/Manco should not be problems as there are existing similar organisations. Loans come from pooled funding, not banks. Role of banks is the best commercial systems for managing the process. Economic growth is a risk - there are scenarios for this. Full report is available on DHET website. Waiting for commission outcome to determine cost of studying. Talking to govt departments about securing bonds.

Khaya: conservative model to only fund poorer students at first. Yale endowment fund is very successful. Economic growth is low because of high unemployment and that needs to be solved. Try the experiment of creating more graduates to increase economic growth. Tuition rates are different and inherited. SA is good at commissioning reports but doing nothing. Relationship between staff salaries and costs of universities for different universities. Universities can charge more for desirable degrees - should we perpetuate this? Since October 2015, a lot more conversation and few tangible outcomes. Staff payments are included in Lesedi model, especially insourcing. State has problems conceptualising what it wants in society. Nothing has been delivered by govt perfectly in terms of the Freedom Charter. 2 professions that are highly interventionist: doctors and accountants. Universities should be about new knowledge and not prescribed syllabi.


Parallel Session: Accommodation, Quality of Higher Education and Student Support

Chair: Clint le Bruyns

- habitat: secure space/environment where life can flourish

- habitus: habits, practices, things we do to embody environment, life affirming


Iain L'Ange, DHET/RU:

- Ministerial commission for the review of student housing at SA universities

- philosopher "looks in a dark room for a black cat"

- meta-physicist "... that isn't there"

- theologian "... and then says I found it"

- shortcoming - focused on universities and not TVET colleges

- no sampling - visited every single campus with student housing

- paucity of student housing and student support research in developing country

-- 1-2 articles only from Africa!

- residence capacities: 10% western Europe; 5% OZ; 16.8% Canada; 23.5% USA; SA 19.8%

-- do we still have a problem?

- what is the status of student housing policies?

-- France - CNOUS - state-run and funded

-- USA & Canada & UK - regulatory frameworks

-- no regulation at any level in SA

- demand around the world

-- most students live at home but growing demand

-- funding is under greater pressure everywhere

-- subsidy does not cover accommodation in SA

- models

-- university residence

-- public/private partnership

-- city/university partnership

- analytical and interpretive framework: access/equity/redress; inclusion/integration; learning/success; cost/financing; quality/standards; governance//management

- residences are social structures, with socio-economic problems

-- support and enhance academic project

-- differences in race, class, gender; different expectations

- findings

-- 107k beds in 2010 for 535k learners

-- only 8% available to first year students

-- 200k bed backlog

-- some universities should have 80% housing because of location

-- pattern of reasonable to excellent accommodation at White universities and reasonable to deplorable accommodation at Black universities

-- major maintenance backlogs

-- conflict between need to provide housing and keep costs low

-- large numbers of students starving because of maladministration of NSFAS

-- recommend multi-institution facilities in the metro areas

- minister gazetted minimal norms and standards for student housing

- without the provision of safe, hygienic housing and adequate nutrition to students, it is an injustice to increase numbers at universities


Matete Madiba, UP:

- we are here because state is abdicating responsibility to be welfare state

- deepening of commodification, undermining sense of humanity

- environment that includes trumpism and trumpology

- wolexit - Wole Soyinka left USA after elections

- fear-mongering - there is a decline and something drastic has to be done

- we need to talk to about why free education is the best step

-- free education will improve quality of education and student support

-- financial support request is the most common request by students and parents

-- accommodation is an issue where parents no longer have housing

- at first lulled into thinking that NSFAS was the answer

-- providing a poor family with a loan adds insult to injury, does not solve problems

-- we are not going to get that loan money back

- instead of mechanistic way of measuring quality, we should look at support and outcomes: where students end up in society

-- need to give the best so graduates can make meaningful contributions

-- we are because of students: principle of ubuntu - our being is tied to them

- participation/graduation rates are low and this is an insult to ourselves

- some students do not want to graduate because of a phobia of entering society and making a meaningful contribution

-- high levels of depression and feelings of inadequacy

- stop thinking of students as customers

-- building students = building our own humanity = respecting who we are


Oliver Seale, SBL, UNISA:

- leadership and management context, challenges and opportunities

- need less anecdotal critique and more research into how leaders can implement well-considered change

- challenges:

-- global and institutional issues

-- now in post-heroic leadership phase

-- most executives and managers are former academics, then parchuted into executive roles

-- executives, senior and middle managers have limited capabilities to lead and manage: dean's study

--- joined because of discipline, not to be managers

--- deans suddenly become dean without any preparation

-- under-representation of women

-- nobody wants to be a VC, no induction or preparation - support simply forgot

-- no succession planning, leadership pipeline, mentorship, coaching

- development implications

-- inadequate research

-- no specific interventions at sectoral level for key roles like deans and HoDs

-- training value is lost when the environment is not enabling

-- integrated leadership development: global and local challenges, skills, competencies

- managed organised leadership development

-- personal development plan as gap handling does not work

-- leadership development drives performance

--- "only fact: leaders are born as babies", leaders are trained

-- it is less about individual leaders than about groups and bottom-up

-- deans are all different and working furiously but not reflecting

-- leadership capital: human, organisational, economic, social

--- when we train people and then they meet goals, we still do not talk about efficiency and innovation in our institutions

- HE Leadership and Management Programme (HELM):

-- focus areas: research on governance, leadership, management; leadership development; advisory services

-- funding coming via DHET as top slice from management training funding

-- activities: induction of academic and admin staff; HE management diploma/Masters; seminars, workshop, conferences; coaching, mentoring; institutional support

Discussion:

Question: Who is going to run our universities in 10 years?  What is the role of private markets in the accommodation system?  University is a covert way for people to benefit from the presence of students.  How are we going to regulate the ways in which universities create conflict between staff and private markets? How many professors have property in Rondebosch?

Khwezi Mabasa, UP: What is the disaggregated figure for accommodation in White and Black universities?  Patriarchal/racist culture in residences - need to shift the debate away from just quantitative.  Patriarchy among VCs - what about race?

Question: problem of space for students and time to construct student accommodation is too long.  What process has been put in place to fast-track construction? What about public-private partnerships?  Problem with student support is that it is on the periphery so not taken seriously.  VCs at forefront but some do not even understand student services.  Increasingly, student affairs are lower down in university structures.  "Non-academic" is offensive, as "non-White" was offensive.  Need more conversation between academics and support staff.

Nirmala Gopal, UKZN: Is there an oversight committee to hold universities accountable for standards in student housing?  What is the impact of academic discourse on student success in residence?  Can we come up with better performance management processes and succession planning processes?

Comment, UL: blame game is not going to assist the situation.  Must not propagate popular policy positions that solve one problem but create other problems.  Staff+students and White+Black struggles are all linked: because of complex capitalist system that divides us.  Staff demoralised when their salaries/positions are used as a solution when fees fall.  What are the practical measures that can be taken to revitalise principles like Ubuntu?  University councils connive with managements and rubber stamp rather than have serious debates.  Portfolio committee on HE needs to make site visits, to hold councils accountable.

Mojanku Gumbi: we have inherited a specific spatial distribution.  Do we accept this or imagine a society that is integrated by race?  How do we plan for that future?  How do universities accredit residences, when some seem unsuitable for students?  Example of accredited residence in Mayfair with large number of female students in unsafe environment.  Leaders of FMF are some of the poorest students, and cannot relate their own lives to the privilege at UCT.  What do we do in the short term to deal with this?

Iain L'Ange: site visits showed extreme overcrowding and very poor quality of accommodation.  Minimum standards policy says that these are not acceptable by stating standards for: design, ablution, etc.  No university should be accrediting accommodation that does not meet standards.  Reports acknowledged the past of advantaged vs. disadvantaged.  70% of recent infrastructure funding went to Black universities.

Matete Madiba: challenge facing students affairs is which side to choose: with students or executive.  Privileged to be the ears of an institution.  But when executive takes away authority, need to find ways to be heard.

Oliver Seale: challenge to change mindsets.  Not much has changed in 22 years.  In OZ student experience is a key measure of quality.  We are good at narratives of division.  We need to take collective ownership to change institutions.  "If we are serious about change, it is about leadership, leadership, leadership."

Parallel Session: Eco-transformation (notes from Maanda Mulaudzi)

Chair: Loshni Govender

Vishwas Satgar:

Karuna Singh:

Bellise Omonde:

Decoloniality

Chair: Robert van Niekerk

- in Cuba (University of Havana), social relationships with academics that are flat, with a common knowledge creation project

- 3 years of national service as part of the process of scholarship

- how do we reach out to academics repressed in occupied Palestine?

Nomalanga Mkhize:

- Ali Mazrui asked: "why does an African feel African?"

- problem is that African cannot ask a question as an African, question has been delegitimised

- Julius Nyerere: Education for self-reliance, asking "we have never really stopped to ask why we want education, what is its purpose...", never thought of education beyond teachers, engineers, etc.

- we have not asked what the purpose of education in SA is

-- we need to answer the question in various ways or the universities have no purpose

-- tackle question not just at philosophical level but in terms of lived experience

- why do people feel African in elite institutions elsewhere

- SA scholarship is entirely premised on White historiography, produced largely by Whites in universities, devoid of African pre-colonial sense

-- example: Julian Corbin - African oral history does not count, state formation can be explained by European colonialists

-- example: Walter Rubusana - documented Black genealogy and is unrecognised

- history of Africans only understood from perspective of White authors

- explaining apartheid is the project of researchers

- labour studies has abstracted the African to just a worker - no agreement among Black and White academics on labour studies

- pre-colonial largely an archaeological fascination

- universities are unwilling to unpack the genealogy of clans

- people turn to a radical lineage at the expense of "Africanity"

- you cannot answer SA's questions without dealing with historiography

-- others have dealt with pre-colonial deficits

- nationalism in Africa is not the same as nationalism in Europe

-- pan-African ideal

--- little space in our universities, first global South must be found

- African nationalism - SA anthem is a prayer for all Africans, unlike European anthems

- we live in a presentism, without cascading histories

-- students' waking up is not the waking up of the world

-- no future sense linked to Africans

-- other Africans cannot explain what the prospects for Africans are in the future


Ndumiso Dladla:

- the question of land abstracted and taken up by people who do not understand its significance

-- humans beings are tied to land by their very being, freedom tied to land

- historical and philosophical problem, problem of ethics

-- based on seizing land of the indigenous people

-- SA is the name of given the White people, formed after war between English and Boer

- indigenous people could be objects of knowledge but not subjects

- we leave the solution to those who created the problem and benefit from it

-- the production of those who must overcome the problem is also left to these people

- ANC's liberal non-racialism based on White and Black having same privileges

- contradiction in lsuch liberal view with property rights entrenched in the constitution when land was the spoils of racial conquest

- liberatory non-racialism requires addressing antagonism, by eliminating White domination by subtracting basis such as land

- university problem is linked to larger social problem

- universities are using conservative gestures, such as decoloniality

-- "decoloniality needs to be decolonised"

-- comes from Latin America, strong assumption that all conquered people had resisted conquest, military and epitemological levels

- African liberation philosophy - early work by Kwame Nkrumah

- first Ghanian constitution recognised problems of defining Ghana as one with the continent

- uncritical acceptance of European knowledge

-- Germans and French do not care what Africans say about European philosophy

- Americans and Europeans come here to mine knowledge

- astounding degrees of deliberate ignorance and commitment to ignorance by White South Africans

- most cannot speak African languages and some claim to know African philosophy

- students are being trained to mimic Europeans but Europeans do not care

- return to pan-African principle of self-determination

-- withdrew from Philosophy Society of South Africa, new Azanian Philosophy Society to be formed

-- network across the continent to reconnect SA to the continent

- universities currently do not buy books from north of the Limpopo


Pitika Ntuli:

- major aim of epistemology is to disrupt how people think

- decolonised education will teach students to use languages with ease

- umfazi is constructed out of the concepts of death and knowledge, but we think of man as the head of the family

- in Sotho, numbers are specified as mathematical constructs, 1,2,3,4,symbolic 3 numbers, -2 -1, 10 (resolved)

- creation myth of group of Mali people for how sky God created matter predated string theory

-- celebration every 60 years of revolution of Sirius B

- Lydenburg heads mirror Norwegian sculptures

- modernity is different in different parts of the world

- after colonisation we failed to get rid of coloniality

- we ceased being subjects and became objects of someone else's history

- decolonisation of the mind is also Eurocentric, Africans cannot recognise the mind outside the mind, spirit, knowledge systems; everything is inter-dependent

- agenda for decoloniality - disobedience of knowledge systems from US/Europe

- template of oppression, we exist on the border-line of the present

- history of Africa is the history of Europeans in Africa

- time/space is indivisible in African culture; compared with Einstein's theories

- quantum physics, religion, culture are all related

- poo throwing was a cultural act

- essence of being, morality, are related to culture

- linked to African renaissance

Discussion:

Question: purpose of education and how do we drive the purpose? What is the role of journals in terms of knowledge dissemination? Study from Oxford shows journals are hardly read. What do we do when universities wants us to publish in high impact journals? Are developed nations the barometer? What about international rankings of universities?

Koogan: Nomalanga stated that Zimbabwe and other African countries are laughing at us - what is meant by this?

Greg, UWC: wilful zombification of the university. We do not know the social and historical context for this process. Need radical rethink of future society. What are engineers doing? Different feelings one gets in different places in the world - we must not become identity fetishists. Where does Africa begin and end - reimagining of geography. Where does Europe begin and end? DA has said that people in this country wants jobs but how do we get these? Did we forget the bread and butter issues when building identity? Need to organise people. Lessons from UDF, AZAPO, etc.

Comment, Unizul: visited African studies department in Canada that is very rich (not financially) but similar departments cannot be found here. Need to go back to study beacons of African philosophy. It is one thing to teach these things but what do we take to government about making Africans out of Africans? Most editors are interested in submissions that fit into their world views.


Ndumiso Dladla: there arent African historiographers in South Africa. New techniques such as use of etymology as a source. We are quite behind in South Africa. Role of journals exposes academic imperialism - centralism. Research programme is memetic. Universities are modeled on institutions elsewhere, from buildings to academic systems. Journal publishing is akin to gangsterism. Requires political will for people to not participate in their own oppression. Cuba suffered for their stand. We can resolve the issue of title to land, but we will be published. If we choose a different mode of publication, so what? Education cannot be for more than liberation. One is free from (which comes first) but also free to. Our current education teaches us to be slaves.

Pitika Ntuli: Chumani came with a totalising view on White people and he was not challenged. We had a great opportunity when universities were merged but we did not exploit the opportunity. Post-modernism is when Western academics realised they had left spiritualism behind. 3 majors revolutions in Western world: agrarian revolution, industrial revolution, commercial revolution. After Berlin wall fell, commerce became central. Whenever anyone raises a question of "who is an African", I die inside. Choose to be an Africanist - an ideological position - rather than an African.


Question: What is happening inside the classroom? Students are stripped of their identities. Majority of academics are White. Is the student not ready or is the academic not ready?

Eddy Webster, Wits: language is fundamental, not just about speaking but understanding different philosophies. Clear narrative of history of dispossesion and conquest. Ndumiso said "we want to kill Whiteness, not Whites", remove system of White privilege/supremacy. Complementary and emerging narrative, Edward Sa'id: "when the coloniser meets the colonised, they cease to be coloniser and colonised - their identities become merged". Steve Biko spoke of a joint culture in SA. Our identity is more than one tradition. Our history is one of reluctant intimacy between Black and White. Student said "I am tired of Whites studying Blacks - I want to study Whites.", and studied White squatters in township in Krugersdorp; "they are becoming like Blacks" and local food, want the local beer, buy their clothes locally; and some are now living together. Maybe something different and embryonic is emerging.

Vishwas Satgar: at the heart of the historical method is the archive.  What is knowledge in the African oral tradition?  May have to unsettle an inherited historical method.  One strategy is to flip US/European theories or pose them against post-Eurocentric thinking.  Why can't we buld an epistemological plurality?

Maanda, UCT: registers opposition, as a sign of respect, that the notion of Africa comes to us without any problems.  Africa and African are a grand narrative.  What would someone living in 18th century in West Africa call themselves - probably not African.  This identity is under construction like every other identity.  We should not celebrate post-colonial African histories without criticism.  One shortcoming is it did not question what history is - it found equivalents in Africa of European models.  Post-colonial task of finding states.  Is the history of ordinary people reproduced in oral tradition, or the history of rulers?

Thomas, Wits: disjuncture between the West/Europe and Africa as broad concepts. Vulgar conception of Africa from elsewhere.  We talk of Europeans as if it is a uniform construction as well.  We also commit the fallacy of vulgarising the West, reproducing the binary and commiting the errors we accuse others of.

Matete Madiba, UP: Dladla - are you suggesting we should be talking about someone other than decoloniality?  Maybe Africanisation?

Comment: we need to do something else.  How do we implement these ideas?  Those who think we can homogenise African experience into a composite identity - there are problems with that.  We might find the Africans contributed to what is modernity, but seems to be Western knowledge.  We want decolonidation, not hybridisation.  Need continuing debate.  Even Western scholars contested marginalisation of knowledge systems.  Need to include excluded knowledge systems.  Who are we, where are we going, and where do we come from?

Pitika Ntuli: lectured post-modernism at Middlesex Univ.  Outside academic there is post-coloniality.  Hybridity is not on the agenda, here we have total revolution to convert subject to object, counter-hegemonic steps instead of auto-hegemonic steps.  Postgraduate course "Imaging the other" viewed post-modernism from the perspective of the other.  Decoloniality seeks resurrection from the espistemic side.  Beind every successful prophet is a Black woman - when we look at Abraham, Moses, etc. in the Bible.

Ndumiso Dladla: existence of Whites in SA is unnatural.  If they came as immigrants they would have been integrated into society.  Certain structures needed to be created, such as systemic ignorance.  Biko's joint culture only comes after resolution of the issues.  Our job is not just to sit at the same table as White people - it is a Black table.  Zulu's accepted Dunns and Finns and immigrants and they are assimilated into the Zulu culture.  Some people are calling for African studies and African restaurants serve indigenous food suggest that the prevailing order is not African.  African cannot be simply another option on the menu - it must be the basis of the unfolding system.  We can dialogue with European traditions but the basis of the dialogue must be African.  In decoloniality we are now replacing European thinking with South American thinking.  Do not go next door to borrow sugar before we check our own cupboards.

Pitika Ntuli: still some resonance with South Americans, who are already thinking beyond us.  Africans are talking about decolonising the mind but S.Americans have introduced decolonising the spirit, etc.

Advancing the Next Generation of Black Graduates, Administrators and Academics

Chair: Sibongiseni Tunzelana

Shireen Hassim:

- teaching political studies at Wits university, runs inclusive professoriate programme

- even Wits that has a long-term transformation programme, and critical left-thinking group, has not trained new academics

- central question in decoloniality, who is designing curricula, doing the teaching, deciding what a discipline looks like

- progress has been slow

- generations of people talking about Black lives but not Black people talking about their lives

- proportion of Black staff is worrying at Wits+UCT

-- 2/3 of staff in Humanities is White

-- at most 11% Black in professoriate

- 7 universities part of a Mellon initiative (Wits, UCT, RU, UP, UWC, UFS, SUN) argue that there are ways of progressing (scaffolding) in the academy and that this is invisible to people who are a first generation in higher education

-- special mechanisms already exist for White people who have been in the network for some time

-- goal to visibilise scaffolding

-- strengthen scaffolding in specific and targeted ways

-- providing resources to enable people to travel abroad, to build network of scholars

-- academic is hierarchical

-- Black scholars have not progressed because White senior scholars have not done their work

-- requirement of supervising PhDs, but students often do not go to Black scholars first

-- programme is not changing Wits criteria, second tier second rate system

--- only awareness and scaffolding assistance

-- real tragedy is that the programme is funded by external donor, when this ought to be a responsibility of the institution

--- just caring university should look after the needs of all its staff

-- previous generation of university professors had different criteria

-- 20 years ago people got promoted on far less than current system

-- academics trained elsewhere were schooled into competitive systems

-- we are facing a changing system with sometimes inappropriate metrics that young staff are faced with


Loshni Govender:

- HR director at RU

- integrated approach to managing talent

- experience of even Black management that people assume we are not qualified; many Blacks professionals feel marginalised

- what a model could and should be; challenges; HR needs to be recurriculated

- interdependent community of practice

- FMF raised staffing issue, social justice issues

- complex environment: interna dynamics, politics, history, geographical factors

-- not yet networking to find effective solutions

- traditional HR models should work but do not

- requirements for talent management

-- consolidated talent management strategy

-- succession planning, and problem of preferential placement so has to be competitive

--- in some institutions, White people are hired for "operational reasons"

-- holistic way to develop all staff: rotation, secondment

-- learning and development strategy

-- plan for critical, scarce and specialist skills

-- focus on targeted development strategies

- strategic objectives

-- culture of life-long learning

-- improve leadership bench strength, need performance enhancement and monitoring

- common areas of concern

-- lack of promotion opportunies for PASS staff

-- little support for developmental pathways

- challenges

-- need proper data management systems

-- move from performance management to performance enhancement

- integrated talent management process

-- problem is we need to adapt and not just adopt

- talent mapping indicators: succession planning, skills development, leadership development

- 2014 study around skills development: strategic skills vs workplace skills

-- institutions are missing the mark

-- emphasis on administrative submissions

- conclusion

-- need to stop heavy reliance on other sector; we are unique

-- need solutions to transformation, EE, development, attraction and retention

-- talk about revolving door of HEIs, struggle for recognition of human rights agenda, lack of understanding of employee rights, migrant labour system


Yasmin Fazel-Ellahi, UCT EU:

- understanding the next generation of administrators and graduates

- development dialogue (DD) system running for 2 years and not necessarily working

- includes job description, career planning, aspirations, etc.

- training given to all staff members for how the DD system works

- it makes it possible for staff to be compensated for excellent performance

- it makes it possible to identify poor performance

- problems:

-- some staff do not attend the training sessions

-- succession planning is not working

-- HR practitioners

--- do not consult timeously with line managers

--- part of faculties and so do not challenge deans/HoDs

--- retirees are then employed on contract, and contract continues without a succession plan

-- staff who are seconded are not always the successful candidate, but required to train successor

-- DD not implemented consistently

-- performance management once a year

--- no continuous feedback

--- staff have to rate themselves and then are rated by managers as rating or exceeding

--- some staff are noted as "not meeting" and this is a shock, they are put on a "performance improvement plan" that is not supposed to be punitive but is often used for this

-- due to austerity measures, staff now have more work with no ability to shadow staff

-- line managers are reluctant for staff to do training, which is outside their objectives

-- no system for following up talent development and future promotion

--- this could benefit the university instead of sourcing staff from outside

-- recently graduated Black staff experience a lot of frustration

--- graduates accept lower grade posts, intending to move up

-- insufficient induction, mentorship, coaching

-- selection committees are not taking employment equity reps seriously

-- VC delegates transformation to deans and HoDs, who are not progressive

-- managers have been in system for a long time and not willing to transform

-- performance awards are mostly given to higher grade staff

- conclusion

-- DD could work well if everyone is trained

-- staff need to stand up for their rights

-- HR practitioners need to play a more active role

-- management needs to think more progressively around succession, governance, transformation


Discussion:

Gladys, WSU: role of unions is very strong at WSU. No promotions for past 20 years because union is blocking promotions since academics are foreign national and there has been a loss of talent. Role of unions is very strong.

Khwezi Mabasa, UP: have to deal with deeper structural issues, such as change in nature of work. Lots of part-time workers, mostly young Black staff. In many institutions, income differential based on race and application of different criteria by race.

Comment: real challenges for Black graduates. Information resources are crucial but there is uneven access across universities. Those who have been disadvantaged because of resources are prone to fail.

Clint le Bruyns, UKZN: her there been reimagining? Does decoloniality apply to academic staff only or also PASS staff? Administrative systems and capitalist values are problematic. Where do staff see themselves in terms of FMF? Is it just compliance or also solidarity?

Wesley Seale, RU: As a matter of social justice we should ask Whites to quit but we don't because of quality. Professors long past their sell-by dates are kept because of quality. Black graduate, you are on your own. Nurturing is not happening. Black staff are complicit in the 2 book system - this was not a requirement in the past. Why does Mellon get promoted more than NGAP? What is being done about holding HoDs accountable - in many instances, White professors. What people have done for transformation is not counted.

Comment: when we know someone is retiring, what does HR do? What was the person doing for the whole year, instead of grooming the person? HoD is responsible for training and supporting people, but they do not do this? Keep people as advisors and disrupt the hierarchy. Nothing comes of performance management in many cases. HR needs to look at positions that are inflated when a person leaves.

Yolanda: young practitioner scared of becoming an academic. The facts that are spoken of at this conference, and other academics, are scary. Current academics are old and frail and never die. Black academics are being punished for being the right colour, pressurised and being put on long probation. Like UJ/UCT scheme for professional practitioners to be considered professional staff. What are the unions doing - quit NEHAWU when at UJ.

Comment: if a person reaches retirement age, they should become adjunct. At UFH, how do you promote support staff? Promotion for academic staff is straight-forward - staff apply at beginning of each year. NHISS scholarships to support people in social science. Seed grants to incentivise publications - R20k per publication or Masters student, R60k for a PhD student. Internally there are funds available to support staff. Teaching/learning and research are both considered. Assumed these systems are universal but it is not the same elsewhere.

Shireen Hassim: we are talking at only one level.  Unless we get support from national govt, we will casualise academia and these will be Black academics.  Also in the way subsidy is applied - this can be dealt with nationally.  Some people have problems with reward systems because it creates individualism in the system.  Performance management approach has now made visible what was invisible before.  In the past, people would say that "we all know how brilliant he is" and there was no need to meet criteria.  No professors with Honours degrees any longer.  There is still racism and there are still blockages.  Programme at Wits means that HoDs can be told about support for young staff.  Wits also uses NGAP.

Yasmin Fazel-ellahi: on PASS staff solidarity with students, there has been support from some staff.  Even when there was a unified march to parliament with permissions from the VC, line managers still did not support this.  Line managers threatened staff who were not at work.  Union has spoken with management that performance assessment should be applied to line managers to keep them accountable.  Transformation and succession planning has been on agenda for 6-7 years but this has not happened.

Loshni Govender: deep structural problems.  Black VC with entire management team being White.  2 years ago, "Blacker" union could only represent low skilled workers.  Irregularities among conditions of service across positions.  Sometimes income differential is a constant battle.  We can take an advocacy approach with this does not work without support from leadership.  Very polarised staff.  Decisions taken by very few.  Students see staff as management.  RU appoints deans and HoDs by nominations, not by advertising.  RU advertised a year in advance for a registrar to ensure the profile of the executive can be changed.  Reality is that appointments are made at committee level, and they then give input - not just HR driving the process.

Ashok, UKZN: problems are countrywide.  Systems used for HR are failing.  Rewards system can be seen as punishment.  Solutions lie in the hands of the HR practitioners, in terms of capacity building, planning, etc.

Koogan: we have to be hopeful for youngsters.  This is the right thing to create a platform for dialogue.  We need the same type of activism we had 20 years ago.  Experienced transformation and union issues.  Offers CCMA case study of contract not being renewed to SAUSNET.

Chumani Maxwele, UCT: this meeting is happening at a revolutionary moment.  Some academics and staff were and are against FMF.  Students have been harrassed and criminalised on behalf of staff.  Looking forward to university staff writing.  Lwazi Lushaba was the first Black South African in Politics Department.  There is a difference in agency of Black South Africans and other Africans.  Lushaba dealt with the question of fear by asking the HoD why there is no Black Masters student in the Pol.Science department in this year.  HoD replied with a single line and then resigned.  Lushaba could speak because of protection of activism.  One of the professional staff was fired during FMF.  We must be prepared to take risks that Lushaba took.  Ghanaian scholar was promoted.  Black pretentious scholars will not have solidarity with students.  Academics claim solidarity but are not willing to enter the line of fire.

Question: What is the role of HR in selection, staffing, promotion, grievance procedures and enforcement of employment equity.  Chairs of committees do not adhere to HR/EE policies in all committees.  When grievances are raised because of bullying, management does not keep to its timeline.  Employee eventually quits - this is constructive dismissal.  Once non-SA Africans are promoted, they promote other non-SA Africans and leave out South Africans.  Approximately 10 cases of people being marginalised.  Why is Wits giving the VC transformation award when no transformation is happening?  Boy's club in some disciplines.  Only faculty that teaches these topics has a moratorium on hiring women.  People retrenched from mining sector get fulltime positions at university.  Lots of problems at Wits.

Loshni Govender: difficult to comment on role of HR at Wits.  On arrival, ER had been outsourced.  Stats were very skewed.  New very progressive amendments in EE act set out how to deal with bullying, etc.  Need to

always go back to legislation.  Need to go to external structures, as reports are lodged with Dept of Labour. WSU had a review by director-general.  Use the equality court and CCMA.


Insourcing (notes from Maanda Mulaudzi)

Chair: Ujala Satgoor


Karel Stanz:

Eddy Webster:


29 January 2017


Institutional Culture


Chair: Vishwas Satgar


Fred Hendricks, RU:

- former dean of Humanities, director of African Humanities Programme, mentor for National Institute for Humanities and Social Science (NIHSS)

-- AHP distributes postdoc fellowships and PhD completion funding

- institutional culture is only slippery is we want it to be so

-- lived experiences are so profoundly different, material significance, deep inequalities

- John Higgins: institutional culture is major barrier to transformation

- we cannot understand culture outside of inequality, unavoidable materiality

- profound inequality between and within universities

- buzzword of differentiation is a euphemism for inequality

- mergers have not solved inequality problem

- students placed their interests on the agenda for the country

-- gave the idea of fundamental change momentum

-- we need to harness the momentum at universities and beyond, provide forum for arguing the way out

- SAUSNET opens up space for sharing of experiences

-- relying on friends at universities is unreliable

-- crucial that SAUSNET establish a national presence

- all of us are complicit in reproducing the status quo

- in spite of protests, very little attention paid to inequalities

-- racialised inequalities, Black campuses at the bottom of the pile

-- Unizul is in an entirely different world from UCT

- higher ed landscape shaped by legacy of apartheid

-- but there should be corrective action

- inevitable that higher ed will be differentiated

-- but needs fundamental transformation if differentiation is due to apartheid

- SAUSNET needs to include Black universities and not marginalise them

- EE is a major issue at White universities

-- Sakkie Mak..: "many people labelled as Black middle class are actually a cheque away from poverty"

-- need Black academic staff for transformation/decolonisation, necessary but not sufficient condition

-- nationally only 10% of professors are Black

-- White females have been used to meet equity targets

-- do we need moratorium on hiring of White academics

- context is also continental and global

-- Thandika Mkandawire: "we (Africa) are probably the only part of the world in which it is legitimate to publish without local scholarship"

-- Somaliland journal of african studies, with no Somali input in first issue

-- need to build communities of scholars of our own, and be vigilant in exposing shams

- Africa only contributes 3% of book output;  95% are school textbooks

- language is an important project in decolonisation

-- irony: UP asked for English, but English is also a colonial language

-- entrenching position of English, spoken by only 10% of population as home language

-- "is nationalism not a course in Africa after all"

-- constitution requires elevation of status and use of languages, but this is simply rhetoric

- education struggles were part of democracy struggle

-- students made their own history in 60s/70s, struggles were animated by promise of a better future

-- led to optimism in 1994, but expected changes did not happen, inequalities were far more durable

- NIHSS: 150 PhDs a year for Black Humanities students


Rozena Maart, UKZN:

- was Director for Centre of Critical Research on Race and Identity

- used concept of White consciousness rather than Whiteness

- assumption that Black people have to follow a certain order in a university

- examines location of subject and asks how subject recognises positions of benficiares and agents of White domination, in context of institutional culture

- Hegel insists on the subjective moment, consciousness of self the basis of any consciousness

- comments from philosophers on slavery without notions of agency

- White men/women are beneficiaries of apartheid

- unpack terms to frame transformation

- UKZN transformation, employing critical race theory, and the historical

-- Black women as subject, consciousness grounded in Black consciousness

--- subject refuses to retransform, already transformed under apartheid

--- anticipated she would utilise her training to be participant in knowledge projects

-- transformation charters were supposed to guide transformation

--- one cannot legislate attitude, no reference to charter how racist attitudes have the ability to stifle, humiliate, etc. Black staff to the point of exclusion

-- production of knowledge: process must be questioned

--- White women question moral but not political, no self-examination of privilege

-- breeding ground at UKZN: last outpost of Whiteness, perpetuation of White academics

- UWC/UFH/etc. were trained for servitude

- African scholarship kept out of university system

-- low numbers of African scholars in higher education

-- history interpreted by colonisers to invisibilise people

--- scholars needs to unearth history of continent, build on unwitting heritage and educate younger generation

--- African scholars produce against colonial background

-- production of knowledge: demand for reason

-- racist normativity is popular

- DHET White paper

-- Bhengu: higher ed system must be transformed to serve new social order, meet national needs, single national coordinated system to solve inefficiencies ... the journey is not going to be easy

-- language conveys Marxist philosophy, conditions for social existence transformed

-- no plan of action or process

- resistance to expression of being

- what of the Black subject and White system

-- how does one conduct empirical research when neither you nor your colleagues are the subject of research, when you are subject to racism by colleagues while researching it

-- attention always drawn away to setting where racialism continues

- witnesses to the German holocaust: validity of experience not questioned

- conflict Rwanda began during German assertion of owernship

-- woman who took cover in cave during genocide told to cite German scholars

- protocol of research in Humanities

-- White scholars theorise; Black scholars talk of experience

- paper in Alternations


Yunus Ballim:

- VC of Sol Plaatjie University, chair of transformation of USAf

- institutional culture is complex but not a fluid concept, can be directed

- 2 aspects:

-- part that derives from external aspects, like reputation

-- internal realities

--- Wits was seen as a strongly anti-apartheid institution, but students found it unpleasant

- institutitonal culture is real

- get sense of universities by watching staff and students interact

-- in some universities, action is immediate but in others there is no action

- institutional culture draws from and influences values

-- values are the things that direct decisions in the absence of rules

- argued at Wits that there must be a shared set of values

-- "but a university is a place where we do not share values"

-- there was a time when academics could refuse to teach classes with Black people - this was a value during apartheid

-- (get over the obsession with humanities - problems occur in all disciplines)

-- on a selection commitee, we cannot not hire a person on political positions

-- if a university has a strong culture, dripping on the walls, people will choose not to work there if they do not agree with the culture

- go to work every morning because somebody is going to disagree with him

-- if colleagues are hiding behind racism, then compromised ability to criticise

- finest gift of intellectuals is honest criticm

- take seriously the possibility of learning from students

-- latest notes are not relevant when all the content is available online

-- developing critical thinkers in students is an aspect of institutional culture

- decolonising the curriculum is not well constructed

-- must retain the possibility of violence as a political strategy

--- only focused on short term gains

--- our response should not just be about getting calm back on campus, or we have misdirected solutions

--- engage with the long term issues, have the protest made a sufficient case for reconsidering the future

- institutional culture can be directed and management must do this

- envious of White students living in residence

-- Black students had to travel back home

-- when residences were opened to Black students, White wardens went away, Black wardens stopped giving critical lectures in residences

-- institutional culture could not conceive that there be intellectual engagement with Black students

- institutional forum:

-- need this forum because of strongly entrenched cultures of White universities

-- irrelevant at most universities, passive non-engagement or active antagonism

-- sectarian interests: unions or students bargaining at forums

-- more significant evidence of IF failure: issues of protests should have come before IF but did not

- new Higher Ed Amendment act entrenches and gives more power to IF

-- council now has to explain why it does not act on IF recommendations

- no outside members should be part of the IF

-- at some universities outside members have influenced policy via IF

-- size has been limited, should have working committees, curriculum committee, staff development

- directed engagement of the institutional project can take place at IF


Discussion:

Greg, UWC: abdurdity that 85% White body must agree to sideline themselves?  Is this a fundamental governance issue?  SUN is funded by big insurance companies, Naspers, financial mafia.  RU is heavily funded from outside (London?).  Global network of power that affects our universities.

Question: can we separate content of what we teach from our experiences?

Matete Madiba, UP: on moratorium of hiring of White staff, committed White academics should go to Black universities to make a contribution.  IF is a product of top-down policy so died easily - members who were supposed to drive IF were hand-picked.  What approach should Black women inside universities take?

Koogen: we are legitimising what is happening if we do nothing.  Transformation is almost non-existent nationally - who do we hold to account?  What is the relationship with DHET, USAf?  How can we hold someone to account and who?


Rozena Maart: sees issues around locating the subject and existentialism, materialist of race.  If people speak highly of a White intellectual, and you find that the person is going to interview you, there is a contemptuous

challenge to their position of being in charge.  On NRF panel to decide on funding going to 2 White chairs, panelist refused to accept context of applicants.  Do share and send experiences to unions, etc. because our experiences are not considered the basis for knowledge production.

Yunus Ballim: we may not get to point where we will not hire White people.  More corrosive for of racism is when well-meaning people expect less of Black people.  Black students prefer White supervisors because they expect less.  Black son of a tribal elder offended because woman from did not acknowledge him.  People are not static in their attitudes.  Lower water pressures specified for Black people in the past!  Students were undereducated when context was not included in their teaching.  Course in development engineering was compulsory.  3 White academics left at Wits engineering? IF did not find its place in the governance structure of universities.  Council is the decision maker and Senate must be responsible for academic decisions - IF must advise both bodies.  Superfluous capital is recruiting superfluous people - the nation state is being redefined.  Groups rights are replacing human rights.  Failure of globalisation is connected and will affect us - we must take a global perspective.  Mathematically the "transformation index" was flawed too.  Transformation oversight committee still exists - responsibility lies with DHET.  Concepts of negotiated self-regulation, where institution proposes plan and negotiates plan with DHET before going to Council.  UFH context is not the same as Wits so institution must find priorities itself.

Fred Hendricks: 50 years ago natural scientists knew more about social world but vice versa but this is no longer the case.  Values are central to any attempt to understand culture.  Gulf between 100% Black protesting students and 85% White management is too huge, so virtually impossible to have shared set of values.  If we focus on structural determination we will have no room for agency.  Students have shown what can be achieved by struggle.  If we have a moratorium on hiring White academics at White universities, it will send a powerful message to concentrate the mind on the real issues of EE.  If we only have 10% of professoriate being Black after 20 years, this is a serious problem.  Be circumspect about state intervention because we will not get rid of them.  We want a community of fellowship.  The biggest accolade is someone reading your work and engaging critically about it.


Rochelle, SUN: how can we make a space for men in feminism.  We make men's spaces feminist.  We should stop White people getting positions in South Africa.  A lot of White academics only engage with these issues at conferences.  Nothing is going to change.  We need to take a little more responsibility.

Rob can Nirkerk, RU: how do we create new epistemic communities centred on Black scholarship while being inclusive?  Part of problem is institutional rivalry in academic project.  Need much more systematic comradeship and more collaborative approach. In Cuba, there no sense that an individual university is the main game in town.  Old strategies have failed - we should try something radical.  It is also scholarly leadership that must be transformed.

Question: problem of academic freedom.  People are despondent but they cannot talk because of fickle egos of management.  Huge politicisation of institutions.  How did we get to the point where academics are not willing to have robust rebate?  Council says that academics should not write to the media but we can defy this, to epitomise a space where we can interrogate our own institutions.  How do we get to a point where we resusictate safe debate at our institutions?  Back at our institutions, everyone is silent.  We should not build students who are conformists and fearful in society.

Clint le Bruyns, UKZN: Kenneth Halstead "the seeds of stuckness can be found in patterns of past success".  If we keep on doing the things we were good at in the past we will be stuck.  FMF challenges us to reconsider our stuckness.  What needs to be disrupted in our institutional culture?  We cannot go on the same way.  What are we willing to participate in that is disruptive?  One issue is bureaucratic system within which institutions work.

Strengthen our global solidarity with Cuba and Palestine.

Fred Hendricks: we have to solve the crisis that confronts us.  Must looks at institutional culture in the context of institutional inequalities, especially the issue of race.

Yunus Ballim: point of leadership is important, but there are only 4 White VCs.  White people are not running our schools either.  But why are we disrespecting those things that are African.  Rude to eat with a knife and fork at home.  We must acknowledge and privilege our views of the world.  Student learning is best served by seeing different views.  In 1890s there was a rise of fascism but many intellectuals joined that movement - we must be cautious about that.  We should worry about the serious threats to academic freedom.  It is more serious when leadership curtails this, rather than when government does this.  This is a complex issue, but the essence of our craft as intellectuals is to deal with complex issues.

Rozena Maart: Black presence at institutions is by itself a disruption.  Very conservative level of understanding of Black students among White academics working on critical race theory.  Students are asked who to invite.  Last year it was Gillian Schutte.  Black students asked for the discussion to be stopped - but White students appreciated the discussion.  We are having those discussions and raise the level of scholarship by having more discussions.

Transforming Disciplines

Chair: Greg Ruiters

- how do we construct knowledge about the world?

- inter- and trans-disciplinary thinking

Patrick Bond:

- last session was disempowering because got his last job

- alliances in the radical White academy is not enough

- need anti-disciplinary approaches

- easy to focus on economics from Cambridge

- corporation as a unit of analysis, Marshall developed model to understand them

- Geography (Halfred Mcinder) reflected need to map for imperialism

- Sociology developed from modernisation in Germany to fight Marx's dialectical approach

- origins of anthropology from measuring head sizes

- JHU started as early site of social sciences

- be critical of hard wiring of disciplines, many were only amended by adding on gender/development/etc.

- why durability of power relations exist

-- Nancy Fraser: capitalism studies

- decommodifying along with decolonisation

- Ben Magubane: tried to link critical race theory to mode of production

- epistemological approach: reproducing class/gender politics

-- maybe a book (with greater academic credit) is the way out of publishing little journal articles where White men reproduce their power

-- this is meant to be knowledge production

-- rich source of knowledge from activism compared to power structures

- most important gain after apartheid was medicines for HIV-positive citizens

-- fighting trade-related property issues: pharma, Elsevier, etc.

-- how did TAC win? PhD student teaches the teachers because academics could be figure out why this worked

- our working class is rated the most militant in the world

- power politics goes everywhere, and the commodification of water struggle continue

- armchair academics need to be informed by class and race/gender politics


Melanie Alperstein:

- People's Health Movement

- right to health for all, principles of equity and social justice

- implement comprehensive primary health care approach, is current policy but somewhat diluted

- equity vs equality: giving appropriate support and removing barriers

- 8m people belong to medical aid, inequity in amount spend per person vs. public

- primary determinants of disease are economic and social

- early colonisers found few diseases but this increased over time

- systems:

-- Pholela project, Emily and Sydney Kark

-- 1944, Gluckman , National Health Commission, single system that catered for all race groups

--- Gluckman policies led to National Health system in UK

-- National Health Policy in 1994

-- now National medical aid

- very little knowledge of health professionals is on government policies and global forces

-- we take biomedical approach rather than understanding the true causes of ill health

- social determinants of health: education, agri, living conditions, employment, water, sanitation

- we need intersectoral collaboration on healthcare

- we do need to bring back indigenous health knowledge in primary health care

Danai Mupotsa, African literature, Wits:

- African popular imaginaries meeting at RU, discussion on English and African literature

- location of department is not a response to English as a language, but an epistemological positioning

- biology "African bee is more violent than the European bee"

- studied biology, then woman studies and African studies; trained in anthropology

- department began with questions of form leading to epistemology

-- relations between subject and object

-- difficulty in reading young scholars is about methodology

- central question is where object becomes transparent and where we become the subjects

- how minor languages have been able to not pull apart object and subject

-- difference between novel as canonical and short story


Sunita Srinivas:

- Africanisation and Internationalisation of the curriculum

- non-negotiable for educators to think critically

- decolonise health - we cannot simply remove medicines without a plan

- in second year students learn about Africa

-- students are from other African countries, not just South Africa

- context - what is happening globally and locally

-- cannot just throw out SDGs

-- scientific truth has to be proven - does not matter how we feel, all about evidence

-- science is about facts - cannot burn what we do not like

-- speak less and do more

- interrogating local information in teaching, social determinants of health

- country case studies - every country of every student is brought in, using published literature

-- students are required to discuss inequalities about African countries

-- how do indicators impact on health

- bigger picture: pedagogical foundations of internationalisation

-- seen question - students have to prepare by reading

- 1/3 of global population do not have access to essential medicines

-- to respond, look at full spectrum of issues

- assignments aligned to how you respond to the local community

- collect data to analyse this: students compare their countries, developed countries, etc.

- work with communities, not just diease->drug->dispense

- research in areas where there is community participation

- teaching using Skype to internationalise experience

- moving towards disease prevention and health promotion

-- diet and lifestyle - connecting the dots

- we cannot decolonise and ignore medicine and progress

- internationalisation award at RU


Discussion:

Michelle Williams, Wits: sociology teaches the health students.  Need more integration between health sciences and social sciences.

Robbie van Niekerk, RU: struggle for free higher education is conducted as a divisible struggle.  But simultaneously we need healthcare to be addressed.  General struggle around public goods.  How to transform curriculum so students become agents of change.  We engage from the strength as Africans with everyone else.  Need to make links with transformed societies like Cuba, but Cuban scholars have been blockaded and do not communicate out.  Cuba is only country where mother->child HIV has been eliminated.

Rob, SUN: elaborate on writing on bachelor parties, wedding, etc. in relation to research and teaching.

Chumani, UCT:  science as facts.  How will you bring that out?  Traditional medicines and sangomas are undermined.  Why does UCT not have a sangoma who students can consult?  Why can't we employ the circumcision practitioners in hospitals?


Danai Mupotsa: people attached to science separate subjective from objective.  Which objects and subjects does neutrality get assigned to?  Work on weddings leading to new Masters course on sensation, feelings, etc.

Melanie Alperstein: when moved to primary healthcare approach, design teams looked at relationship between science and social science.  Over years, social sciences are being pushed out.

Sunita Srinivas: sociologists as other voices are brought into classroom. In 4th year, alternative medicine (one week) is introduced with sangomas and others.


Declaration:

- 9. we do not need a commission for basic education - we need solutions

- 10. we need articulation between TVET and Unis for students who move between these institutions

- where do we go next?

- 1. we need a commission of inquiry and not just restorative justice, maybe a national project

- see some things that represent the workers, but it is not enough.  Our focus is on students, but for the workers to be part of SAUSNET we need to include more of the problems workers face, such as development of workers.  Talk to those who do not have education, those who work in the kitchens, gardens.

- need to look at framing. Higher ed located within struggles for public good: water, welfare, health.  More forceful point needed: higher ed locates itself within struggles for public good.

- struggle is not only SA, but also continental and international.  We will learn from countries that have transformed, like Cuba.  What is the concentation point of global solidarity - Palestine. Need specificities on these.

- use of the word "workers" - think of workers and managers as a discourse within universities.  How will we effect all of these proposals?  Interdicts - a task team is too slow in acting.

- Monday: deadline for comments to sausnetwork@gmail.com

- Tuesday: document will be online on website


Mary Metcalfe, Trusted Convenors:

- thought participation, level of debate, etc. was excellent

- fact that university staff are coming together along old divides is timeous

- major impetus for policy debate is within SAUSNET, we need to take them further in multiple ways

-- take debates back into/across institutions, notwithstanding institutional politics

- Eddie says: who remembers UDUSA - need to urgently go back to that level of debate

- Jay spoke about civil society initiative - SAUSNET delcaration reinforces the need for this forum

-- National Education Crisis Forum

-- first event is the Higher Education Crisis Forum

-- over time, deal with crises in other sectors, such as TVET

- NECF is trying to mobilise civil society

-- logo captures complexity, diversity, convergence, disciplined interaction

- only way HECF will succeed in finding resolution if it is inclusive

-- manage competition and conflict and bring everyone in

- series of workstreams:

-- funding model (Mojanku Gumbi): resources available, insourcing, funding fees

--- keep complexity of students, management, academics in the process

-- transformation (Jay Naidoo, Pitika Ntuli):

-- access and massification (Mary Metcalfe):

-- accommodation ():

-- deal with immediate crisis:

-- peace building (SACC):

--- Bonginkosi Khanyile got 64% as a lowest mark, writing in prison, 84% for both other courses

--- complex and emotional issues

--- must keep in urgent contact with SACC, HEPARD, etc.

--- HEPARD says: student struggles have positive and negative possibilities

- need participation in workstreams

- resurgence of engagement around policy issues

-- Tutu "the price of freedom is eternal vigilence"


Ujala Satgoor, RU:

- thanks and closing

- thanks to: Trusted Convenors, Nelson Mandela Foundation and funders, COPAC, Thomas, Bellise, Marisha, Convening Committee, Planning and Drafting Committees, Southern Sun group and OR Tambo Garden Court, speakers, delegates

- 115 delegates